## Excitations of a quantum solid

## Daniel Podolsky



Collaborators: S. Gazit, H. Nonne, A. Auerbach, D. Arovas

## Helium 4 - Phase diagram



## Inelastic neutron scattering

Optical mode observed!



Markovic et al., PRL 88, 195301 ('02)
(110)

## Multiple optical modes?

## Look at different directions and polarizations



Pelleg et al, PRB 73, 180301R ('06)


Markovic et al., PRL 88, 195301 ('02)


Pelleg et al., JLTP 151, 1164 ('08)

## Harmonic theory of solids



Fluctuations:


Small fluctuations $\quad \sqrt{\left\langle\mathbf{u}^{2}\right\rangle} \ll \Delta R$

$$
U_{\mathrm{harm}}=\frac{1}{2} \sum_{\mathbf{R R}^{\prime}} \sum_{\mu \nu} u_{\mu}(\mathbf{R}) D_{\mu \nu}\left(\mathbf{R}-\mathbf{R}^{\prime}\right) u_{\nu}\left(\mathbf{R}^{\prime}\right)
$$

Monatomic Bravais lattice $\Rightarrow$ acoustic phonons only
Corrections to harmonic theory:

$$
U_{\mathrm{anh}} \sim u^{3}+u^{4}+\ldots
$$

Lindemann criterion: $\sqrt{\left\langle\mathbf{u}^{2}\right\rangle}=0.1 \Delta R \quad \Rightarrow$ melting

## Helium - A quantum solid

Atoms do not sit at minimum of V :


Large zero point motion:
H. Glyde, "Helium, Solid"

| Rare-gas | Debye <br> temperature <br> crystal | Melting <br> temperature <br> $\theta_{\mathrm{D}}(\mathrm{K})$ | Debye zero <br> point energy <br> $T_{M}(\mathrm{~K})$ | Lindemann <br> $E_{\mathrm{ZD}}=\frac{9}{8} \theta_{\mathrm{D}}$ |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :--- |
| $\delta=\left\langle u^{2}\right\rangle^{1 / 2} / R$ |  |  |  |  |
| ${ }^{3} \mathrm{He}(\mathrm{bcc})$ | 19 | 0.65 | 21 | 0.368 |
| ${ }^{4} \mathrm{He}(\mathrm{bcc})$ | 25 | 1.6 | 28 | 0.292 |
| Ne | 66 | 24.6 | 74 | 0.091 |
| Ar | 84 | 83.8 | 95 | 0.048 |
| Kr | 64 | 161.4 | 72 | 0.036 |
| Xe | 55 | 202.0 | 62 | 0.028 |

Harmonic theory does not give correct acoustic phonon velocities

## Large quantum fluctuations

$\Rightarrow$ restoring force is non-linear

$$
-M-M-M-M_{-}^{u_{i}}-M-M-M-M
$$

$m \ddot{u}_{i}=-\kappa\left(u_{i}-u_{i+1}\right)-\kappa\left(u_{i}-u_{i-1}\right)+\gamma\left(u_{i}-u_{i+1}\right)^{2}+\gamma\left(u_{i}-u_{i-1}\right)^{2}+\cdots$
$\Rightarrow$ Non-linear equations can in principle give multiple solutions (more phonons than number of degrees of freedom)
$\Rightarrow$ How to construct a linear theory for optical modes?

## A different point of view

Idealized crystal:


## A different point of view

Helium:


Bragg peaks:


Focus on dynamics of principal Bragg vectors
Can we think of solid $\mathrm{He}-4$ as a charge density wave (CDW)?
A CDW allows naturally for gapped modes:
"phason"

$\omega \sim c q$
"amplitudon"

$\omega \sim \sqrt{m^{2}+c^{2} q^{2}}$

## Ginzburg-Landau theory for 3D CDW

Density modulation: $\quad \rho(\mathbf{r})=n(\mathbf{r})-n_{0}$
Assume order parameter is small (large fluctuations):

$$
F_{\mathrm{GL}}=\frac{1}{2} \int d \mathbf{r}_{1} d \mathbf{r}_{2} \rho\left(\mathbf{r}_{1}\right) \chi^{-1}\left(\mathbf{r}_{1}-\mathbf{r}_{2}\right) \rho\left(\mathbf{r}_{2}\right)-B \int d \mathbf{r} \rho(\mathbf{r})^{3}+C \int d \mathbf{r} \rho(\mathbf{r})^{4}
$$

In Fourier space:

$$
\begin{aligned}
F_{\mathrm{GL}} & =\frac{1}{2} \int d \mathbf{k} \frac{1}{\tilde{\chi}(\mathbf{k})}|\rho(\mathbf{k})|^{2}-B \int d \mathbf{k}_{1} d \mathbf{k}_{2} d \mathbf{k}_{3} \rho\left(\mathbf{k}_{1}\right) \rho\left(\mathbf{k}_{2}\right) \rho\left(\mathbf{k}_{3}\right) \delta\left(\mathbf{k}_{1}+\mathbf{k}_{2}+\mathbf{k}_{3}\right) \\
& \left.+C \int d \mathbf{k}_{1} d \mathbf{k}_{2} d \mathbf{k}_{3} d \mathbf{k}_{4} \rho\left(\mathbf{k}_{1}\right) \rho\left(\mathbf{k}_{2}\right) \rho\left(\mathbf{k}_{3}\right) \rho\left(\mathbf{k}_{4}\right)\right) \delta\left(\mathbf{k}_{1}+\mathbf{k}_{2}+\mathbf{k}_{3}+\mathbf{k}_{4}\right)
\end{aligned}
$$

Static susceptibility:


## 

 Baym, Bethe, and Pethick, Nuc. Phys. A175, 225 (1971)Minimize $\mathrm{F}_{G L}$, order by order:

$$
\begin{aligned}
F_{\mathrm{GL}} & \left.=\frac{1}{2} \int d \mathbf{k} \frac{1}{\tilde{\chi}(\mathbf{k})}|\rho(\mathbf{k})|^{2}\right)-B \int d \mathbf{k}_{1} d \mathbf{k}_{2} d \mathbf{k}_{3} \rho\left(\mathbf{k}_{1}\right) \rho\left(\mathbf{k}_{2}\right) \rho\left(\mathbf{k}_{3}\right) \delta\left(\mathbf{k}_{1}+\mathbf{k}_{2}+\mathbf{k}_{3}\right) \\
& \left.+C \int d \mathbf{k}_{1} d \mathbf{k}_{2} d \mathbf{k}_{3} d \mathbf{k}_{4} \rho\left(\mathbf{k}_{1}\right) \rho\left(\mathbf{k}_{2}\right) \rho\left(\mathbf{k}_{3}\right) \rho\left(\mathbf{k}_{4}\right)\right) \delta\left(\mathbf{k}_{1}+\mathbf{k}_{2}+\mathbf{k}_{3}+\mathbf{k}_{4}\right)
\end{aligned}
$$

1. "Condense" on sphere k=G

$$
\rho(\mathbf{k}) \neq 0 \quad|\mathbf{k}|=G
$$

2. Maximize number of triangles with zero total momentum


## 

 Baym, Bethe, and Pethick, Nuc. Phys. A175, 225 (1971)Minimize $\mathrm{F}_{G L}$, order by order:

$$
\begin{aligned}
F_{\mathrm{GL}} & \left.=\frac{1}{2} \int d \mathbf{k} \frac{1}{\tilde{\chi}(\mathbf{k})}|\rho(\mathbf{k})|^{2}\right)-B \int d \mathbf{k}_{1} d \mathbf{k}_{2} d \mathbf{k}_{3} \rho\left(\mathbf{k}_{1}\right) \rho\left(\mathbf{k}_{2}\right) \rho\left(\mathbf{k}_{3}\right) \delta\left(\mathbf{k}_{1}+\mathbf{k}_{2}+\mathbf{k}_{3}\right) \\
& \left.+C \int d \mathbf{k}_{1} d \mathbf{k}_{2} d \mathbf{k}_{3} d \mathbf{k}_{4} \rho\left(\mathbf{k}_{1}\right) \rho\left(\mathbf{k}_{2}\right) \rho\left(\mathbf{k}_{3}\right) \rho\left(\mathbf{k}_{4}\right)\right) \delta\left(\mathbf{k}_{1}+\mathbf{k}_{2}+\mathbf{k}_{3}+\mathbf{k}_{4}\right)
\end{aligned}
$$

1. "Condense" on sphere k=G

$$
\rho(\mathbf{k}) \neq 0 \quad|\mathbf{k}|=G
$$

2. Maximize number of triangles with zero total momentum


BCC wins:


## Collective modes

Dynamical Ginzburg-Landau: $\quad L=\frac{1}{2} \int d^{3} r\left(\frac{\partial \rho}{\partial t}\right)^{2}-F_{\mathrm{GL}}$

Fluctuations about mean-field:

$$
\begin{gathered}
\rho(\mathbf{r}, t)=\sum_{i}\left(\bar{\rho}_{i}+\psi_{i}(\mathbf{r}, t)\right) e^{i \mathbf{G}_{i} \cdot \mathbf{r}} \\
\psi_{i}(\mathbf{r}, t)=\psi_{-i}^{*}(\mathbf{r}, t)
\end{gathered}
$$



Linearize Euler-Lagrange equations
6 pairs of reciprocal lattice vectors $\Rightarrow 12$ modes

## Visualizing the optical modes


$d_{x y}$ "quadrupolon" has vanishing z-axis spring constant $\Rightarrow$ flat band

## Which gapped mode is lowest?

Breather or quadruplon, depends on GL parameters:


## Neutron scattering

Dynamical structure factor: $\quad S(\mathbf{q}, \omega)=\operatorname{Im}\left\{\left\langle\delta \rho_{\mathbf{G}}(\mathbf{q}, \omega) \delta \rho_{-\mathbf{G}}(-\mathbf{q},-\omega)\right\rangle\right\}$
Compute by quantizing Ginzburg-Landau action. Result:

$$
S(\mathbf{G}+\mathbf{q}, \omega)=\sum_{\alpha} \frac{M_{\mathbf{G}, \alpha}(\mathbf{q})}{2 \omega_{\alpha}(\mathbf{q})}\left[\left(1+n_{B}\left(\omega_{\alpha}\right)\right) \delta\left(\omega-\omega_{\alpha}(\mathbf{q})\right)-n_{B}\left(\omega_{\alpha}\right) \delta\left(\omega+\omega_{\alpha}(\mathbf{q})\right)\right]
$$

Note - sum rule is satisfied:

$$
\int_{-\infty}^{\infty} d \omega \omega S(\mathbf{G}+\mathbf{q}, \omega)=1
$$

Hence, despite having more phonons than predicted by harmonic theory, the overall spectral weight remains the same. We have not introduced spurious degrees of freedom.
(110)

## Comparison to experiment




Markovic et al., PRL 88, 195301 ('02)



Pelleg et al, PRB 73, 180301R ('06)

## Quantum Monte Carlo

$A B$-initio simulations


$$
\begin{aligned}
H & =-\frac{1}{2 m} \sum_{i=i}^{N} \nabla_{i}^{2}+\sum_{i<j} V_{A z i z}\left(r_{i}-r_{j}\right) \\
n_{0} & =0.02854 \AA^{-3} \\
T & =1.6 K
\end{aligned}
$$

Place 2000 atoms in a box with periodic BC
Simulate using continuous space path integral QMC

## Quantum Monte Carlo

2000 He 4 Atoms


BCC phase
large zero point motion

Structure factor:

$$
S(\mathbf{q}, \omega)=\langle\rho(\mathbf{q}, \omega) \rho(-\mathbf{q},-\omega)\rangle \quad \rho(\mathbf{q}, t)=\sum_{n} e^{i \mathbf{q} \cdot \mathbf{r}_{n}(t)}
$$

QMC simulations are performed along the imaginary time axis, perform numerical analytical continuation to real time.

## QMC results

## L(110) dispersion

At Bragg vector:



## QMC results

L(110) dispersion


At Bragg vector:


Confirms presence of optical mode (e.g. not due to crystal domains).

## QMC results

L(110) dispersion


At Bragg vector:


Confirms presence of optical mode (e.g. not due to crystal domains).
Small energy. Difficulty with analytical continuation?
Lowest optical mode missed by experiment?

## Summary:

* In Helium, harmonic theory fails due to large zero point motion
* New "harmonic theory" for the optical modes
* QMC finds low energy optical mode - could it be there?
* Prediction: such modes should appear in other quantum solids (solid Helium-3, 2d and 3d CDWs, etc)

