Energy Spectra and Fluxes of Buoyancy-Driven Flows

Abhishek Kumar Mahendra K. Verma Indian Institute of Technology Kanpur, India









it.snhu.edu







solarwiki.ucdavis.edu













RBC Unstable Stably Stratified flow Stable

$$\partial_t \mathbf{u} + (\mathbf{u} \cdot \nabla) \mathbf{u} = -\nabla p + \alpha g \theta \hat{z} + \nu \nabla^2 \mathbf{u} + \mathbf{f}$$
$$\partial_t \theta + (\mathbf{u} \cdot \nabla) \theta = -\frac{d\overline{T}}{dz} u_z + \kappa \nabla^2 \theta$$













fluctuations







$$\frac{\partial \mathbf{u}}{\partial t} + (\mathbf{u}.\nabla)\mathbf{u} = -\nabla p + \theta \,\hat{z} + \sqrt{\frac{\Pr}{\operatorname{Ra}}}\nabla^2 \mathbf{u} + \mathbf{f}$$
$$\frac{\partial \theta}{\partial t} + (\mathbf{u}.\nabla)\theta = Su_z + \frac{1}{\sqrt{\operatorname{Ra}}}\nabla^2 \theta$$

$$\frac{\partial \mathbf{u}}{\partial t} + (\mathbf{u}.\nabla)\mathbf{u} = -\nabla p + \theta \,\hat{z} + \sqrt{\frac{\Pr}{\operatorname{Ra}}}\nabla^{2}\mathbf{u} + \mathbf{f}$$
$$\frac{\partial \theta}{\partial t} + (\mathbf{u}.\nabla)\theta = Su_{z} + \frac{1}{\sqrt{\operatorname{Ra}}}\nabla^{2}\theta$$
  
Rayleigh Number

$$\frac{\partial \mathbf{u}}{\partial t} + (\mathbf{u}.\nabla)\mathbf{u} = -\nabla p + \theta \,\hat{z} + \sqrt{\frac{\Pr}{\operatorname{Ra}}} \nabla^2 \mathbf{u} + \mathbf{f}$$
$$\frac{\partial \theta}{\partial t} + (\mathbf{u}.\nabla)\theta = Su_z + \frac{1}{\sqrt{\operatorname{Ra}\operatorname{Pr}}} \nabla^2 \theta$$
  
Rayleigh Number

$$Ra = \frac{\alpha g d^4}{\nu \kappa} \frac{d\overline{T}}{dz}$$

$$\frac{\partial \mathbf{u}}{\partial t} + (\mathbf{u}.\nabla)\mathbf{u} = -\nabla p + \theta \,\hat{z} + \sqrt{\frac{\Pr}{\operatorname{Ra}}} \nabla^2 \mathbf{u} + \mathbf{f}$$

$$\frac{\partial \theta}{\partial t} + (\mathbf{u}.\nabla)\theta = Su_z + \frac{1}{\sqrt{\operatorname{RaPr}}} \nabla^2 \theta$$
Rayleigh Number
$$\operatorname{Ra} = \frac{\alpha g d^4}{\nu \kappa} \frac{d\overline{T}}{dz}$$
Prandtl Number





 $\frac{Solar \ Convection}{Ra \sim 10^{20}}$   $Pr \sim 10^{-6}$ 



# $\frac{\text{Earth's Mantle}}{\text{Ra} \sim 10^7}$ $\text{Pr} \sim 10^{25}$



<u>Jupiter</u> Ra ~ 10<sup>24</sup> Pr ~ 1



$$\frac{\partial}{\partial t}\hat{\mathbf{u}}(\mathbf{k},t) = -i\mathbf{k}\hat{p}(\mathbf{k}) - \widehat{(\mathbf{u}\cdot\nabla)\mathbf{u}} + \widehat{\theta}(\mathbf{k},t)\hat{z} - \nu k^2\widehat{\mathbf{u}}(\mathbf{k},t)$$

$$\hat{\mathbf{u}}^*(\mathbf{k},t) \cdot \left[ \frac{\partial}{\partial t} \hat{\mathbf{u}}(\mathbf{k},t) = -i\mathbf{k}\hat{p}(\mathbf{k}) - \widehat{(\mathbf{u},\nabla)\mathbf{u}} + \widehat{\theta}(\mathbf{k},t)\hat{z} - \nu k^2 \widehat{\mathbf{u}}(\mathbf{k},t) \right] + c.c$$

$$\hat{\mathbf{u}}^{*}(\mathbf{k},t) \cdot \left[ \frac{\partial}{\partial t} \hat{\mathbf{u}}(\mathbf{k},t) = -i\mathbf{k}\hat{p}(\mathbf{k}) - \widehat{(\mathbf{u}\cdot\nabla)\mathbf{u}} + \widehat{\theta}(\mathbf{k},t)\hat{z} - \nu k^{2}\hat{\mathbf{u}}(\mathbf{k},t) \right] + c.c$$
$$\frac{\partial}{\partial t}E(k,t) = T(k) + \mathcal{F}_{B}(k) - D(k)$$

$$\hat{\mathbf{u}}^{*}(\mathbf{k},t) \cdot \left[ \frac{\partial}{\partial t} \hat{\mathbf{u}}(\mathbf{k},t) = -i\mathbf{k}\hat{p}(\mathbf{k}) - \widehat{(\mathbf{u},\nabla)\mathbf{u}} + \widehat{\theta}(\mathbf{k},t)\hat{z} - \nu k^{2}\hat{\mathbf{u}}(\mathbf{k},t) \right] + c.c$$
$$\frac{\partial}{\partial t}E(k,t) = T(k) + \mathcal{F}_{B}(k) - D(k)$$
$$\sum_{k} \frac{1}{2} |u(k)|^{2}$$

$$\hat{\mathbf{u}}^{*}(\mathbf{k},t) \cdot \left[ \frac{\partial}{\partial t} \hat{\mathbf{u}}(\mathbf{k},t) = -i\mathbf{k}\hat{p}(\mathbf{k}) - \widehat{(\mathbf{u},\nabla)\mathbf{u}} + \widehat{\theta}(\mathbf{k},t)\hat{z} - \nu k^{2}\hat{\mathbf{u}}(\mathbf{k},t) \right] + c.c$$
$$\frac{\partial}{\partial t}E(k,t) = T(k) + \mathcal{F}_{B}(k) - D(k)$$
$$\sum_{k} \frac{1}{2} |u(k)|^{2} - \frac{d\Pi(k)}{dk}$$

$$\hat{\mathbf{u}}^{*}(\mathbf{k},t) \cdot \left[ \frac{\partial}{\partial t} \hat{\mathbf{u}}(\mathbf{k},t) = -i\mathbf{k}\hat{p}(\mathbf{k}) - \widehat{(\mathbf{u},\nabla)\mathbf{u}} + \hat{\theta}(\mathbf{k},t)\hat{z} - \nu k^{2}\hat{\mathbf{u}}(\mathbf{k},t) \right] + c.c$$

$$\frac{\partial}{\partial t}E(k,t) = T(k) + \mathcal{F}_{B}(k) - D(k)$$

$$\sum_{k} \frac{1}{2} |u(k)|^{2} - \frac{d\Pi(k)}{dk} \sum_{k} \Re\langle \widehat{u_{z}}(\mathbf{k})\hat{\theta}^{*}(\mathbf{k}) \rangle$$

$$\hat{\mathbf{u}}^{*}(\mathbf{k},t) \cdot \left[ \frac{\partial}{\partial t} \hat{\mathbf{u}}(\mathbf{k},t) = -i\mathbf{k}\hat{p}(\mathbf{k}) - (\mathbf{u}.\nabla)\mathbf{u} + \hat{\theta}(\mathbf{k},t)\hat{z} - \nu k^{2}\hat{\mathbf{u}}(\mathbf{k},t) \right] + c.c.$$

$$\frac{\partial}{\partial t}E(k,t) = T(k) + \mathcal{F}_{B}(k) - D(k)$$

$$\sum_{k} \frac{1}{2} |u(k)|^{2} - \frac{d\Pi(k)}{dk} \sum_{k} \Re\langle \hat{u_{z}}(\mathbf{k})\hat{\theta}^{*}(\mathbf{k})\rangle = \sum_{k} 2\nu k^{2}E(k)$$

$$\hat{\mathbf{u}}^{*}(\mathbf{k},t) \cdot \left[\frac{\partial}{\partial t}\hat{\mathbf{u}}(\mathbf{k},t) = -i\mathbf{k}\hat{p}(\mathbf{k}) - (\mathbf{u}.\nabla)\mathbf{u} + \hat{\theta}(\mathbf{k},t)\hat{z} - \nu k^{2}\hat{\mathbf{u}}(\mathbf{k},t)\right] + c.c.$$
Steady State
$$\frac{\partial}{\partial t}E(k,t) = T(k) + \mathcal{F}_{B}(k) - D(k)$$

$$\sum_{k} \frac{1}{2}|u(k)|^{2} - \frac{d\Pi(k)}{dk} \sum_{k} \Re\langle \hat{u_{z}}(\mathbf{k})\hat{\theta}^{*}(\mathbf{k})\rangle \sum_{k} 2\nu k^{2}E(k)$$

$$\hat{\mathbf{u}}^{*}(\mathbf{k},t) \cdot \left[ \frac{\partial}{\partial t} \hat{\mathbf{u}}(\mathbf{k},t) = -i\mathbf{k}\hat{p}(\mathbf{k}) - \widehat{(\mathbf{u},\nabla)\mathbf{u}} + \widehat{\theta}(\mathbf{k},t)\hat{z} - \nu k^{2}\hat{\mathbf{u}}(\mathbf{k},t) \right] + c.c$$
Steady State
$$\frac{\partial}{\partial t} \underbrace{E(k,t)}_{k} = T(k) + \mathcal{F}_{B}(k) - D(k)$$

$$-\frac{d\Pi(k)}{dk} \sum_{k} \Re \langle \widehat{u_{z}}(\mathbf{k})\widehat{\theta}^{*}(\mathbf{k}) \rangle \sum_{k} 2\nu k^{2}E(k)$$
Time evolution equation for kinetic energy in Fourier space

$$\hat{\mathbf{u}}^{*}(\mathbf{k},t) \cdot \left[\frac{\partial}{\partial t}\hat{\mathbf{u}}(\mathbf{k},t) = -i\mathbf{k}\hat{p}(\mathbf{k}) - (\mathbf{u}.\nabla)\mathbf{u} + \hat{\theta}(\mathbf{k},t)\hat{z} - \nu k^{2}\hat{\mathbf{u}}(\mathbf{k},t)\right] + c.c$$
Steady State
$$\frac{\partial}{\partial t}E(k,t) = T(k) + \mathcal{F}_{B}(k) - D(k)$$

$$-\frac{d\Pi(k)}{dk}\sum_{k}\Re\langle\hat{u}_{z}(\mathbf{k})\hat{\theta}^{*}(\mathbf{k})\rangle = \sum_{k}2\nu k^{2}E(k)$$

$$\frac{d\Pi(k)}{dk} = \mathcal{F}_{B}(k) - D(k)$$

Time evolution equation for kinetic energy in Fourier space

$$\hat{\mathbf{u}}^{*}(\mathbf{k},t) \cdot \left[\frac{\partial}{\partial t}\hat{\mathbf{u}}(\mathbf{k},t) = -i\mathbf{k}\hat{p}(\mathbf{k}) - (\mathbf{u}.\nabla)\mathbf{u} + \hat{\theta}(\mathbf{k},t)\hat{z} - \nu k^{2}\hat{\mathbf{u}}(\mathbf{k},t)\right] + c.c$$
Steady State
$$\frac{\partial}{\partial t}E(k,t) = T(k) + \mathcal{F}_{B}(k) - D(k)$$

$$-\frac{d\Pi(k)}{dk}\sum_{k}\Re\langle\hat{u}_{z}(\mathbf{k})\hat{\theta}^{*}(\mathbf{k})\rangle = \sum_{k}2\nu k^{2}E(k)$$

$$\frac{d\Pi(k)}{dk} = \mathcal{F}_{B}(k) - D(k)$$



 Energy is injected by the external force at large length scales.



- Energy is injected by the external force at large length scales.
- Large eddies break into smaller eddies and energy flows from large-scale to small-scale.



- Energy is injected by the external force at large length scales.
- Large eddies break into smaller eddies and energy flows from large-scale to small-scale.
- At sufficiently small scales energy is dissipated by the viscosity.
  - Kolmogorov 1941



- Energy is injected by the external force at large length scales.
- Large eddies break into smaller eddies and energy flows from large-scale to small-scale.
- At sufficiently small scales energy is dissipated by the viscosity.
  - Kolmogorov 1941



$$(y)^{n}$$

$$(y)^{n}$$

$$(y)^{n}$$

$$(x)^{n}$$

$$(x)^$$

$$E(k) = K_{Ko} \Pi^{2/3} k^{-5/3}$$

Phenomenology of Buoyancy-Driven Turbulence



Bolgiano, 1959 Obukhov, 1959



- Turbulent Re>>1
- Moderately stratified Fr~1







Advective ~ Buoyancy  $(\mathbf{u}.\nabla)\mathbf{u} \approx \alpha g \theta \hat{z}$ 

























#### Procaccia & Zaitak, 1989;

Procaccia & Zaitak, 1989; L'vov & Falkovich, 1991, 1992

Procaccia & Zaitak, 1989; L'vov & Falkovich, 1991, 1992 Rubinstein (1994)

Procaccia & Zaitak, 1989; L'vov & Falkovich, 1991, 1992 Rubinstein (1994) As buoyancy is active..

Procaccia & Zaitak, 1989; L'vov & Falkovich, 1991, 1992 Rubinstein (1994) As buoyancy is active.. So expect same as SST

Procaccia & Zaitak, 1989; L'vov & Falkovich, 1991, 1992 Rubinstein (1994) As buoyancy is active.. So expect same as SST But .. Not so!!





For  $k < k_t$ 



For  $k < k_t$  $\Pi_u(k)$  will increase



For  $k < k_t$  $\Pi_u(k)$  will increase

For  $k_t < k < k_d$


For  $k_t < k < k_d$ 

 $\mathcal{F}_{\!\scriptscriptstyle B}(k) \approx D(k)$ 

Kumar et al. PRE 2014



For  $k_t < k < k_d$  $\mathcal{F}_{R}(k) \approx D(k)$ 



Kumar et al. PRE 2014



For  $k_t < k < k_d$ 

 $\mathcal{F}_{\!\scriptscriptstyle B}(k) \approx D(k)$ 

$$\frac{d\Pi(k)}{dk} = \mathcal{F}_B(k) - D(k)$$

Kumar et al. PRE 2014





For 
$$k_t < k < k_d$$
  
 $\mathcal{F}_B(k) \approx D(k)$ 

$$\frac{d\Pi(k)}{dk} = \mathcal{F}_B(k) - D(k)$$

Kumar et al. PRE 2014





Kumar et al. PRE 2014



Kumar et al. PRE 2014







 $\frac{d\Pi(k)}{dk} = \mathcal{F}(k) - D(k)$ 

 $\Pi(k + \Delta k) = \Pi(k) + \left[\mathcal{F}(k) - D(k)\right] \Delta k$ 



HT















 $\Pi(k) \quad \Pi(k + \Delta k)$ 

D(k)

 $HT \qquad \boldsymbol{\mathcal{F}}(k) = 0$ 





```
\Pi(k + \Delta k) = \Pi(k) + \left[\mathcal{F}(k) - D(k)\right] \Delta k
```

 $\Pi(k) \qquad \Pi(k + \Delta k)$ 

D(k)

**HT**  $\mathcal{F}(k) = 0$   $\Pi(k) = \text{const.}$   $E(k) \sim k^{-5/3}$ 







D(k)

 $\Pi(k + \Delta k)$ 

 $\Pi(k)$ 

 $\mathcal{F}_{\mathsf{R}}(\mathsf{k})$ 



**HT**  $\mathcal{F}(k) = 0$   $\Pi(k) = \text{const.}$   $E(k) \sim k^{-5/3}$ 

**SST**  $\boldsymbol{\mathcal{F}}_{B}(k) < 0$ 







```
\Pi(k + \Delta k) = \Pi(k) + \left[\mathcal{F}(k) - D(k)\right] \Delta k
```

 $\Pi(k) \qquad \Pi(k + \Delta k)$ 

D(k)

**HT**  $\mathcal{F}(k) = 0$   $\Pi(k) = \text{const.}$   $E(k) \sim k^{-5/3}$ 

**SST**  $\boldsymbol{\mathcal{F}}_{B}(k) < 0$ 





 $\Pi(k) \quad \Pi(k + \Delta k)$ 

D(k)

**HT**  $\mathcal{F}(k) = 0$   $\Pi(k) = \text{const.}$   $E(k) \sim k^{-5/3}$ 

**SST**  $\mathcal{F}_{B}(k) < 0 \quad \Pi(k) \sim k^{-4/5}$ 





 $\Pi(k) \quad \Pi(k + \Delta k)$ 

D(k)

**HT**  $\mathcal{F}(k) = 0$   $\Pi(k) = \text{const.}$   $E(k) \sim k^{-5/3}$ 

**SST**  $\mathcal{F}_{B}(k) < 0$   $\Pi(k) \sim k^{-4/5}$   $E(k) \sim k^{-11/5}$ 



D(k)

 $\Pi(k + \Delta k)$ 

 $\Pi(k)$ 





**HT**  $\mathcal{F}(k) = 0$   $\Pi(k) = \text{const.}$   $E(k) \sim k^{-5/3}$ 

**SST**  $\mathcal{F}_{\mathsf{B}}(\mathsf{k}) < 0$   $\Pi(k) \sim k^{-4/5}$   $E(k) \sim k^{-11/5}$ 

RBC

D(k)

 $\Pi(k + \Delta k)$ 

 $\Pi(k)$ 





**HT**  $\mathcal{F}(k) = 0$   $\Pi(k) = \text{const.}$   $E(k) \sim k^{-5/3}$ 

**SST**  $\mathcal{F}_{\mathsf{B}}(\mathsf{k}) < 0$   $\Pi(k) \sim k^{-4/5}$   $E(k) \sim k^{-11/5}$ 

D(k)

 $\Pi(k + \Delta k)$ 

 $\Pi(k)$ 





**HT**  $\mathcal{F}(k) = 0$   $\Pi(k) = \text{const.}$   $E(k) \sim k^{-5/3}$ 

**SST**  $\mathcal{F}_{\mathsf{B}}(\mathsf{k}) < 0$   $\Pi(k) \sim k^{-4/5}$   $E(k) \sim k^{-11/5}$ 

D(k)

 $\Pi(k + \Delta k)$ 

 $\Pi(k)$ 

 $\mathcal{F}_{\mathsf{B}}(\mathsf{k})$ 



$$\Pi(k + \Delta k) = \Pi(k) + \left[\mathcal{F}(k) - D(k)\right] \Delta k$$

**HT**  $\mathcal{F}(k) = 0$   $\Pi(k) = \text{const.}$   $E(k) \sim k^{-5/3}$ 

**SST**  $\mathcal{F}_{\mathsf{B}}(\mathsf{k}) < 0$   $\Pi(k) \sim k^{-4/5}$   $E(k) \sim k^{-11/5}$ 

D(k)

 $\Pi(k + \Delta k)$ 



**HT**  $\mathcal{F}(k) = 0$   $\Pi(k) = \text{const.}$   $E(k) \sim k^{-5/3}$ 

**SST**  $\mathcal{F}_{\mathsf{B}}(\mathsf{k}) < 0$   $\Pi(k) \sim k^{-4/5}$   $E(k) \sim k^{-11/5}$ 

**RBC**  $\boldsymbol{\mathcal{F}}_{B}(k) > 0$ 

 $\boldsymbol{\mathcal{F}}_{B}(k)$ 

 $\Pi(k)$ 



$$\Pi(k + \Delta k) = \Pi(k) + \left[\mathcal{F}(k) - D(k)\right] \Delta k$$

 $\Pi(k) \qquad \Pi(k + \Delta k)$ 

 $\mathcal{F}_{\mathsf{R}}(\mathsf{k})$ 

D(k)

**HT**  $\mathcal{F}(k) = 0$   $\Pi(k) = \text{const.}$   $E(k) \sim k^{-5/3}$ 

**SST**  $\mathcal{F}_{\mathsf{B}}(\mathsf{k}) < 0$   $\Pi(k) \sim k^{-4/5}$   $E(k) \sim k^{-11/5}$ 



$$\Pi(k + \Delta k) = \Pi(k) + \left[\mathcal{F}(k) - D(k)\right] \Delta k$$

 $\Pi(k) \quad \Pi(k + \Delta k)$ 

 $\mathcal{F}_{\mathsf{R}}(\mathsf{k})$ 

D(k)

**HT**  $\mathcal{F}(k) = 0$   $\Pi(k) = \text{const.}$   $E(k) \sim k^{-5/3}$ 

**SST**  $\mathcal{F}_{\mathsf{B}}(\mathsf{k}) < 0$   $\Pi(k) \sim k^{-4/5}$   $E(k) \sim k^{-11/5}$ 

**RBC**  $\boldsymbol{\mathcal{F}}_{B}(k) > 0$  $\boldsymbol{\mathcal{F}}_{B}(k) \sim D(k)$ 



$$\Pi(k + \Delta k) = \Pi(k) + \left[\mathcal{F}(k) - D(k)\right] \Delta k$$

 $\Pi(k) \qquad \Pi(k + \Delta k)$ 

 $\mathcal{F}_{\mathsf{R}}(\mathsf{k})$ 

)(k)

**HT**  $\mathcal{F}(k) = 0$   $\Pi(k) = \text{const.}$   $E(k) \sim k^{-5/3}$ 

**SST**  $\mathcal{F}_{\mathsf{B}}(\mathsf{k}) < 0$   $\Pi(k) \sim k^{-4/5}$   $E(k) \sim k^{-11/5}$ 

**RBC**  $\mathcal{F}_{B}(k) > 0 \ \Pi(k) = \text{const.}$  $\mathcal{F}_{B}(k) \sim D(k)$ 

 $\frac{d\Pi(k)}{dk} = \mathcal{F}(k) - D(k)$ 

 $\Pi(k + \Delta k) = \Pi(k) + \left[\mathcal{F}(k) - D(k)\right] \Delta k$ 

 $\Pi(k) \qquad \Pi(k + \Delta k)$ 

 $\mathcal{F}_{\mathsf{R}}(\mathsf{k})$ 

D(k)

**HT** F(k) = 0  $\Pi(k) = \text{const.}$   $E(k) \sim k^{-5/3}$ 

**SST**  $\mathcal{F}_{\mathsf{B}}(\mathsf{k}) < 0$   $\Pi(k) \sim k^{-4/5}$   $E(k) \sim k^{-11/5}$ 

**RBC**  $\mathcal{F}_{B}(k) > 0$   $\Pi(k) = \text{const.}$   $E(k) \sim k^{-5/3}$  $\mathcal{F}_{B}(k) \sim D(k)$  Earlier Work



Nastrom et al. Nature 1985



• ~ 500 -2000 Km -> k<sup>-3</sup>

Nastrom *et al.* Nature 1985



- ~ 500 -2000 Km -> k<sup>-3</sup>
- ~ 2 500 Km -> k<sup>-5/3</sup>

Nastrom *et al.* Nature 1985



- ~ 500 -2000 Km -> k<sup>-3</sup>
- ~ 2 500 Km -> k<sup>-5/3</sup>
- k-5/3 due Backward energy cascade with energy source at kilometer scales. [Falkovich PRL 1992]

Nastrom et al. Nature 1985



- ~ 500 -2000 Km -> k<sup>-3</sup>
- ~ 2 500 Km -> k<sup>-5/3</sup>
- k-5/3 due Backward energy cascade with energy source at kilometer scales. [Falkovich PRL 1992]
- DNS supports forward energy cascade for k-5/3 in Stably stratified turbulence.
  [Lindborg and coworkers]

Nastrom *et al.* Nature 1985


Nastrom *et al.* Nature 1985

- ~ 500 -2000 Km -> k<sup>-3</sup>
- ~ 2 500 Km -> k<sup>-5/3</sup>
- k-5/3 due Backward energy cascade with energy source at kilometer scales. [Falkovich PRL 1992]
- DNS supports forward energy cascade for k-5/3 in Stably stratified turbulence.
  [Lindborg and coworkers]
- Lindborg (2005,2006); Brethouwer et al. (2007), Vallgren et al. (2011), Bartello and Tobias (2013)

### Stably Stratified Turbulence



Zhang, Wu, and Xia PRL(2005)

Seychelles et al. PRL(2008)

• Models

- Models
  - Grossmann and Lohse (1991): KO scaling

- Models
  - Grossmann and Lohse (1991): KO scaling
  - Brandenburg (1992): BO scaling

- Models
  - Grossmann and Lohse (1991): KO scaling
  - Brandenburg (1992): BO scaling
  - Ching and Cheng (2008): BO scaling

- Models
  - Grossmann and Lohse (1991): KO scaling
  - Brandenburg (1992): BO scaling
  - Ching and Cheng (2008): BO scaling
- DNS

- Models
  - Grossmann and Lohse (1991): KO scaling
  - Brandenburg (1992): BO scaling
  - Ching and Cheng (2008): BO scaling
- DNS
  - Borue & Orszag (1997), Škandera, Busse, & Müller(2007): KO scaling in with periodic box.

- Models
  - Grossmann and Lohse (1991): KO scaling
  - Brandenburg (1992): BO scaling
  - Ching and Cheng (2008): BO scaling
- DNS
  - Borue & Orszag (1997), Škandera, Busse, & Müller(2007): KO scaling in with periodic box.
  - Mishra and Verma (2010): KO scaling for Pr ~ 0.

- Models
  - Grossmann and Lohse (1991): KO scaling
  - Brandenburg (1992): BO scaling
  - Ching and Cheng (2008): BO scaling
- DNS
  - Borue & Orszag (1997), Škandera, Busse, & Müller(2007): KO scaling in with periodic box.
  - Mishra and Verma (2010): KO scaling for Pr ~ 0.
  - Verzicco and Camussi (2004): BO scaling.

- Models
  - Grossmann and Lohse (1991): KO scaling
  - Brandenburg (1992): BO scaling
  - Ching and Cheng (2008): BO scaling
- DNS
  - Borue & Orszag (1997), Škandera, Busse, & Müller(2007): KO scaling in with periodic box.
  - Mishra and Verma (2010): KO scaling for Pr ~ 0.
  - Verzicco and Camussi (2004): BO scaling.
  - Calzavarini et al. (2002): BO in the boundary layer, KO in the bulk.

- Models
  - Grossmann and Lohse (1991): KO scaling
  - Brandenburg (1992): BO scaling
  - Ching and Cheng (2008): BO scaling
- DNS
  - Borue & Orszag (1997), Škandera, Busse, & Müller(2007): KO scaling in with periodic box.
  - Mishra and Verma (2010): KO scaling for Pr ~ 0.
  - Verzicco and Camussi (2004): BO scaling.
  - Calzavarini et al. (2002): BO in the boundary layer, KO in the bulk.
- Experiment: Wu *et al.*(1990), Castaing (1990), Chillà *et al.* (1993), Cioni *et al.* (1995), Niemela *et al.* (2000), Zhou and Xia (2001), Shang and Xia (2001), Mashiko *et al.*(2004), Sun *et al.*(2006) : KO or BO.

- Models
  - Grossmann and Lohse (1991): KO scaling
  - Brandenburg (1992): BO scaling
  - Ching and Cheng (2008): BO scaling
- DNS
  - Borue & Orszag (1997), Škandera, Busse, & Müller(2007): KO scaling in with periodic box.
  - Mishra and Verma (2010): KO scaling for Pr ~ 0.
  - Verzicco and Camussi (2004): BO scaling.
  - Calzavarini et al. (2002): BO in the boundary layer, KO in the bulk.
- Experiment: Wu *et al.*(1990), Castaing (1990), Chillà *et al.* (1993), Cioni *et al.* (1995), Niemela *et al.* (2000), Zhou and Xia (2001), Shang and Xia (2001), Mashiko *et al.*(2004), Sun *et al.*(2006) : KO or BO.
- Review: Lohse and Xia, ARFM (2010)

Our Work



• Pseudo-spectral code: Tarang



- Pseudo-spectral code: Tarang
- Time stepping: RK4 method



- Pseudo-spectral code: Tarang
- Time stepping: RK4 method





- Pseudo-spectral code: Tarang
- Time stepping: RK4 method



Periodic BC (**u**,θ) Stal

- Pseudo-spectral code: Tarang
- Time stepping: RK4 method

Periodic BC  $(\mathbf{u}, \theta)$ 





- Pseudo-spectral code: Tarang
- Time stepping: RK4 method



Periodic BC  $(\mathbf{u}, \theta)$ 

Free-slip BC 
$$u_z = 0$$
  
 $\partial_z u_x = \partial_z u_y = 0$  RBC

- Pseudo-spectral code: Tarang
- Time stepping: RK4 method



Periodic BC  $(\mathbf{u}, \theta)$ 

Free-slip BC 
$$u_z = 0$$
  
 $\partial_z u_x = \partial_z u_y = 0$   
Conducting plates  $\theta = 0$ 

### Stably Stratified Turbulence Simulation Results

Grid =  $1024^3$ Ra = 5000 Pr = 1 Fr = 10; Re = 649
























### Weakly Stratified Flow Fr >> 1











Grid = 512<sup>3</sup> Ra = 0.1 Re = 510 Fr = 1.5 x 10<sup>3</sup>





Rayleigh-Bénard Convection

Grid =  $4096^3$ Ra =  $1.1 \times 10^{11}$ Pr = 1Re =  $4.5 \times 10^4$ 





















 $\frac{d\Pi_u(k)}{dk} = \mathcal{F}_B(k) - D(k)$ 



Ring Spectrum & Shell-to-Shell Energy Transfer Rayleigh-Bénard Convection



#### Verma et al. NJP 2017

#### **Ring Spectrum**



#### **Ring Spectrum**



Verma et al. NJP 2017



#### **Ring Spectrum**

















n Receiver





Verma et al. NJP 2017

Forward & local energy transfer

Stably Stratified Turbulence

Stably Stratified Turbulence

• BO scaling for  $Fr \sim 1$ .

Stably Stratified Turbulence

- BO scaling for  $Fr \sim 1$ .
- KO scaling for Fr >> 1.

Stably Stratified Turbulence

- BO scaling for  $Fr \sim 1$ .
- KO scaling for Fr >> 1.

RBC
Stably Stratified Turbulence

- BO scaling for  $Fr \sim 1$ .
- KO scaling for Fr >> 1.

RBC

• KO scaling in three dimension.

### Stably Stratified Turbulence

- BO scaling for  $Fr \sim 1$ .
- KO scaling for Fr >> 1.

### RBC

- KO scaling in three dimension.
- Nearly isotropic behavior

### Stably Stratified Turbulence

- BO scaling for  $Fr \sim 1$ .
- KO scaling for Fr >> 1.

### RBC

- KO scaling in three dimension.
- Nearly isotropic behavior
- Forward & local energy transfer

### Stably Stratified Turbulence

- BO scaling for  $Fr \sim 1$ .
- KO scaling for Fr >> 1.

### RBC

- KO scaling in three dimension.
- Nearly isotropic behavior
- Forward & local energy transfer

A. Kumar, Chatterjee, & Verma, Phys. Rev. E **90**, 023016 (2014). Kumar and Verma, Phys. Rev. E **91**, 043014 (2015) Nath, Pandey, Kumar and Verma, Phys. Rev. Fluids **1**, 064302 (2017)

# Recent Outcome

J. K. Bhattacharjee, Kolmogorov argument for the scaling of the energy spectrum in a stratified fluid. Phys. Lett. A (2015)

D. Rosenberg *et al.*, *Evidence for Bolgiano-Obukhov* scaling in rotating stratified turbulence using high-resolution direct numerical simulations. Phys. Fluids (2015)

S. S. Pawar and J. H. Arakeri, *Kinetic energy and scalar* spectra in high Rayleigh number axially homogeneous buoyancy driven turbulence. Phys. Fluids (2016)

## **New Journal of Physics**

The open access journal at the forefront of physics



Published in partnership with: Deutsche Physikalische Gesellschaft and the Institute of Physics

#### PAPER

## Phenomenology of buoyancy-driven turbulence: recent results

#### Mahendra K Verma, Abhishek Kumar and Ambrish Pandey

Department of Physics, Indian Institute of Technology Kanpur, Kanpur 208016, India

E-mail: mkv@iitk.ac.in

Keywords: buoyancy-driven flows, Rayleigh–Benard convection, stably-stratified turbulence, thermal convection, thermally-driven turbulence

## **New Journal of Physics**

The open access journal at the forefront of physics



Published in partnership with: Deutsche Physikalische Gesellschaft and the Institute of Physics

#### PAPER

## Phenomenology of buoyancy-driven turbulence: recent results

#### Mahendra K Verma, Abhishek Kumar and Ambrish Pandey

Department of Physics, Indian Institute of Technology Kanpur, Kanpur 208016, India

E-mail: mkv@iitk.ac.in

Keywords: buoyancy-driven flows, Rayleigh–Benard convection, stably-stratified turbulence, thermal convection, thermally-driven turbulence

# Thank You